

Appendix B: Olding Road - Options Appraisal Matrix

	Option A	Option B	Option C	Option D	Option E
	Essential Investment Option (employment use/mixed use)	Full Demolition Option (no development)	Full (Heavy) Refurbishment Option (employment use/mixed use)	Full Demolition and Redvelopment Option (retail use)	AME Option
Environmental	Reuse of the existing frame reduces embodied carbon. Opportunity for large solar array on roof. Limited opportunity to create an all electric site. Limited opportunity to improve the energy improvement of the fabric (apart from roof).	Increased embodied carbon due to demolishing the existing frame. Loss of roof - no opportunity for large solar array on roof (unless canopy mounted, which requires significant further investment).	Reuse of the existing frame reduces embodied carbon. Opportunity for large solar array on roof. Opportunity for BREEAM excellent. Opportunity to create an all electric site.	Opportunity for some solar array on roof. Opportunity for BREEAM excellent (new build). Opportunity to create an all electric site. Increased embodied carbon due to demolishing the existing frame.	Opportunity for some solar array on roof. Opportunity for BREEAM excellent (new build). Opportunity to create an all electric site. Increased embodied carbon due to demolishing the existing frame.
Planning	Accords with the current and emerging Local Plan. Consistent with previous Council decisions on third party sites. Supports the delivery of the council's strategic priorities. Requires planning permission for the change of use and the retention of the battery storage.	Accords with the current and emerging Local Plan. Consistent with previous Council decisions on third party sites. Requires planning permission for the change of use (dependent on use) and the retention of the battery storage.	Accords with current and emerging Local Plan. Consistent with previous Council decisions on third party sites. Requires planning permission for the change of use (dependent on use) and the retention of the battery storage.	Contrary to National and Local policy, including the current and emerging Local Plan. Requires planning permission for the change of use and a sequential test and retail impact assessment (out of centre retail proposal). Conflicts with previous Council decisions on third party sites.	Accords with current and emerging Local Plan. Consistent with Council decisions on third party sites.
Highways/Utilities	Expected to result in least amount of impact on network across options. May see some increase in vehicle movements. Third Party negotiations/approvals may be needed if Highway improvement works are triggered. Offsite improvements to cycle and pedestrian routes likely to be required by Highways.	Expected to result in least amount of impact on network across options. May see some increase in vehicle movements. Third Party negotiations/approvals may be needed if Highway improvement works are triggered. Offsite improvements to cycle and pedestrian routes likely to be required by Highways.	May see some increase in vehicle movements. Third Party negotiations/ approvals are likely to be needed if Highway improvement works are triggered. Offsite improvements to cycle and pedestrian routes likely to be required by Highways.	May see some increase in vehicle movements. Third Party negotiations/ approvals are likely to be needed if Highway improvement works are triggered. Offsite improvements to cycle and pedestrian routes likely to be required by Highways.	Highways and utilities capacities remain a risk and require further investigation to ensure the site has sufficient capacity for this development. May see some increase in vehicle movements. Third Party negotiations/ approvals are likely to be needed if Highway improvement works are triggered. Offsite improvements to cycle and pedestrian routes likely to be required by Highways.
Locality Impact	Positive impact on locality through recreational community use. Some increased traffic.	Area will be left somewhat redundant, visually unattractive (unless further capital is invested and may be required to assist with the narrative of this option). Some increased traffic.	Positive impact on locality through recreational community use. Some increased traffic.	Some increased traffic.	Positive impact on locality through local small business growth. Increased traffic.
Market Demand	Registered interest received from a trampoline park for the depot. Limited demand for light industrial and community uses.	Healthy demand for yard space for storage on 5 year leases due to lower rental level.	National occupiers with strong covenants will prefer the full refurb options. Market demand may be limited due because community uses can't afford the higher rents. The trampoline tenant ruled out this option.	Live requirements for retail in the town. Two registered retail interests for this site. Questionable whether there is sufficient demand for retail in the town overall to justify retail on the whole site.	High rent levels for new build units might discourage some tenants.
Deliverability Risk	Low deliverability risk.	Low deliverability risk.	Medium deliverability risk (due to high capital costs).	High deliverability risk.	High deliverability risk.
Future flexibility	Future development options remain available. Retains asset and therefore value.	Future development options remain available. Removes a building asset that has a potential to generate income.	Retains and invests in the asset. Limits future developments on the site.	Limits future developments on the site.	Limits potential for other future developments on the site.
Programme (speed)	Shortest delivery programme (site operational early 2026).	Shortest delivery programme (site operational early 2026).	Longer delivery period than Option A.	Significantly longer delivery period than Option A.	Significantly longer delivery period than Option A.
Link to Strategic Priorities	Temporary uses support the 'Thriving Communities' and 'Sustainable Growth' priority on a temporary basis (during the short-term leases). Protects skatepark and provides area for potential future expansion to deliver further 'Thriving Communities' objectives.	Further work required on alternative uses to deliver council objectives in the short-term and additional investment required.	Uses support the 'Thriving Communities' and 'Sustainable Growth' objectives on a permanent basis .	Strategic priority is to continue to support West Suffolk's Local High Street's and Markets as the vibrant centres of thriving Local communities. This option goes against this objective.	Supports the 'Sustainable Growth' objective on a permanent basis and helps to reestablish an employment site.